			#	
State of North Carolina Division of Archives and History NDIVIDUAL PROPERTY FORM FOR		Cumberland	COUNTY	
		Fayettevill	e QUAD	
Fayette	eville			
	TIPLE RESOURCE OR	THEMA	TIC NOMINATION	
1 NAME	ti en anti-tal anti-			
(Former	r) Fayetteville Mutual	Insurance Company	Building	n an
AND/OR COMMON Point N	Jews			
2 LOCATION				
STREET & NUMBER		i		
	Street		NOT FOR PUBLICATION	4 · · ·
CITY, TOWN	999 - Marine Marine, I.		CONGRESSIONAL DIST	RICT
<u> </u>	eville	VICINITY OF CODE	<u>7th</u>	CODE
	Carolina 0		umberland	051
3 CLASSIFIC				
CATEGORY	OWNERSHIP	STATUS		SENTUSE
	PUBLIC XPRIVATE		AGRICULTURE	MUSEUM
		—UNOCCUPIED —WORK IN PROGRESS	COMMERCIAL EDUCATIONAL	
SITE	PUBLIC ACQUISITION	ACCESSIBLE	ENTERTAINMENT	
OBJECT	IN PROCESS	YES: RESTRICTED	GOVERNMENT	
	BEING CONSIDERED	X YES: UNRESTRICTED	_INDUSTRIAL	TRANSPORTATION
	N/A	NO	MILITARY	OTHER
OWNER O	FPROPERTY			
5/8 int	erest: Bertha Isabell	Le Westbrook 3/8	3 interest: Char	les Sandlin Tay
	Rowle 1, Box 219A	21	17 December Declara	
311 D.	Clinton Avenue		517 Furman Drive STATE	
CITY, TOWN Const				
CITY, TOWN COAY	orth Carolina 28334			n Carolina 283
Dunn, N	orth Carolina 28334	VICINITY OF Fa	ayetteville, North	n Carolina 283
Dunn, N 5 LOCATION	orth Carolina 28334 N OF LEGAL DESCR	VICINITY OF Fa		n Carolina 283
Dunn, N DICATION COURTHOUSE.	orth Carolina 28334 NOF LEGAL DESCR	VICINITY OF Fa	ayetteville, North	n Carolina 283
Dunn, N DICATION COURTHOUSE.	orth Carolina 28334	VICINITY OF Fa	ayetteville, North	n Carolina 283
Dunn, N 5 LOCATION COURTHOUSE REGISTRX OF DEEDS STREET & NUMBER P.O. BO	orth Carolina 28334 N OF LEGAL DESCR ^{Fro} of Deeds, Cumberland	VICINITY OF Fa	ayetteville, North	n Carolina 283
Dunn, N 5 LOCATION COURTHOUSE REGISTRX OF DEEDS STREET & NUMBER P.O. BO CITY, TOWN	orth Carolina 28334 N OF LEGAL DESCR ^{F^{TC}of Deeds, Cumberland x 2039}	VICINITY OF Fa	ayetteville, North	
Dunn, N 5 LOCATION COURTHOUSE REGISTRY OF DEEDS STREET & NUMBER P.O. BO CITY. TOWN Fayette	orth Carolina 28334 N OF LEGAL DESCR F ^{rc} of Deeds, Cumberland x 2039 ville	VICINITY OF Fa	ayetteville, North	
Dunn, N 5 LOCATION COURTHOUSE REGISTRX OF DEEDS STREET & NUMBER P.O. BO CITY. TOWN Fayette 5 FORM PRE	orth Carolina 28334 N OF LEGAL DESCR F ^{rc} of Deeds, Cumberland x 2039 ville	VICINITY OF Fa	ayetteville, North	
Dunn, N DUNN, N COURTHOUSE. REGISTRY OF DEEDS STREET & NUMBER P.O. BO CITY. TOWN Fayette FORM PRE NAME / TITLE	orth Carolina 28334 N OF LEGAL DESCR F ^{rc} of Deeds, Cumberlanc x 2039 ville PARED BY	VICINITY OF Fa IPTION 1 County Courthouse	state North Carolin	
Dunn, N 5 LOCATION COURTHOUSE REGISTRY OF DEEDS STREET & NUMBER P.O. BO CITY. TOWN Fayette FORM PRE NAME / TITLE Linda Ja	orth Carolina 28334 N OF LEGAL DESCR F ^{rc} of Deeds, Cumberland x 2039 ville	VICINITY OF Fa IPTION 1 County Courthouse	state State North Carolin Fayetteville	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
Dunn, N 5 LOCATION COURTHOUSE REGISTRY OF DEEDS STREET & NUMBER P.O. BO CITY. TOWN Fayette FORM PRE NAME / TITLE Linda Ja ORGANIZATION	orth Carolina 28334 N OF LEGAL DESCR F ^{rc} of Deeds, Cumberland x 2039 ville PARED BY asperse, Principal Inv	VICINITY OF Fa IPTION 1 County Courthouse / / vestigator, City of	state State North Carolin Fayetteville Date	na 28302
Dunn, N 5 LOCATION COURTHOUSE REGISTRY OF DEEDS STREET & NUMBER P.O. BO CITY. TOWN Fayette FORM PRE NAME / TITLE Linda Ja ORGANIZATION	orth Carolina 28334 N OF LEGAL DESCR F ^{rc} of Deeds, Cumberlanc x 2039 ville PARED BY	VICINITY OF Fa IPTION 1 County Courthouse / / vestigator, City of	state State North Carolin Fayetteville	na 28302
Dunn, N 5 LOCATION COURTHOUSE REGISTRX OF DEEDS STREET & NUMBER P.O. BO CITY. TOWN Fayette 5 FORM PRE NAME / TITLE Linda Ja ORGANIZATION Consulta STREET & NUMBER Division	orth Carolina 28334 N OF LEGAL DESCR F ^{rc} of Deeds, Cumberland x 2039 ville PARED BY asperse, Principal Inv	VICINITY OF Fa IPTION 1 County Courthouse / vestigator, City of anning Branch	state State North Carolin Fayetteville Date March 31, 198 TELEPHONE Street 1-919-7	na 28302
Dunn, N 5 LOCATION COURTHOUSE REGISTRX OF DEEDS STREET & NUMBER P.O. BO CITY. TOWN Fayette FORM PRE NAME / TITLE Linda Ja ORGANIZATION Consulta STREET & NUMBER	orth Carolina 28334 N OF LEGAL DESCR F ^{ro} of Deeds, Cumberland x 2039 ville PARED BY asperse, Principal Inv ant for Survey and Pla n of Archives and Hist	VICINITY OF Fa IPTION 1 County Courthouse / vestigator, City of anning Branch	state State North Carolin Fayetteville Date March 31, 198 TELEPHONE	na 28302 32 733-6545

·

7 **DESCRIPTION**

	CONDITION	CHECK ONE	CHECK ONE	
X_EXCELLENT	DETERIORATED		_XORIGINAL SITE	
GOOD	RUINS	ALTERED	MOVED DATE	
FAIR	UNEXPOSED			

DESCRIBE THE PRESENT AND ORIGINAL (IF KNOWN) PHYSICAL APPEARANCE

The (Former) Fayetteville Mutual Insurance Company Building c. 1853 is situated on the triangular lot created by the intersection of Old and Hay Streets in downtown Fayetteville. Remnants of eighteenth century street patterns, the two streets converged to form a point which during the antebellum period marked the center point between the town's wholesale grocery and dry goods districts. The existence of a local mutual insurance company, housed in a storefront which is a uniquely-shaped example of the Greek Revival commercial venacular, testifies to the economic, industrial, and mercantile prosperity of 1830s-1850s Fayetteville.

The two-story wedge-shaped brick building originally had four bay front fenestration which with the presence of 6/1 sash windows remains intact on the second story. First floor fenestration consists of a single door, picture window, and a narrow window with two-light transom near the east end, replacements for the two original single center windows and flanking paired door-window combinations. First floor openings are covered by a protective rectangular awning above the main entrance which is adorned with advertising signs for goods such as magazines, newspapers, candies and tobacco offered for sale within. Above the brick walls, which are now stuccoed, is a gutter and three-step squared cornice. Capping the entire building is a standing seam-covered tin hip roof which is characteristic of the Greek Revival.

The west end of the building--nearest the triangular point--bears a single first-story picture window covered by a fabric awning. It is surmounted to roof level by additional signs.

The only other exposed side is to the rear or north which is skewed to that on the front or south. It was probably two-bay at one time but some windows have been bricked over and the openings scattered. The first floor bears a single door at the east end and a picture window and transomed door to the west. Two window openings are still present on the second-story level; the left is six-over-one and the right screened and hooded. On the exterior, the (Former) Fayetteville Mutual Insurance Company Building is straghtforward, simple, and functional, and bears no decorative features.

The interior has been transformed into sales space and a grill. The first floor is one large trapezoidal room which has an end dining area as well as the above-named features. It has a cyma recta molding near the ceiling. The upstairs is accessible by a narrow straight staircase which runs along the inside of the north wall. Upstairs, partitions have been erected to provide for hall, kitchen, office, storage and bathroom facilities--truly maximum use of limited floor space! It is on the second-story level where the original chimney flue, plastered walls, and simple wide wooden window surrounds are visible, despite the partitions and modern ceiling and floor covers.

8 SIGN	IFICANCE	NATIONAL	STATEX	LOCAL
PERIOD PREHISTORIC 1400-1499 1500-1599 1600-1699 1700-1799 X_1800-1899 1900-	AF ARCHEOLOGY-PREHISTORIC ARCHEOLOGY-HISTORIC AGRICULTURE XARCHITECTURE ART YCOMMERCE COMMUNICATIONS	REAS OF SIGNIFICANCE CH COMMUNITY PLANNING CONSERVATION ECONOMICS EDUCATION ENGINEERING EXPLORATION/SETTLEMENT INVENTION	HECK AND JUSTIFY BELOW LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTURE LAW LITERATURE MILITARY MUSIC PHILOSOPHY POLITICS/GOVERNMENT	RELIGION SCIENCE SCULPTURE SOCIAL/HUMANITARIAN THEATER TRANSPORTATION OTHER (SPECIFY)
SPECIFIC DAT	ES _{ca.} 1853	BUILDER/ARCH	HITECT unknown	

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

The Fayetteville Mutual Insurance Company was formed in 1853 to make property and fire insurance available locally rather than from out-of-town or out-of-state agencies. One of only two antebellum survivals of the commercial venacular Greek Revival, the building which housed the company was centrally located on Hay Street between the town's thriving wholesale grocery and dry goods districts. The formation and growth of the Fayetteville Mutual Insurance Company was made possible during a period of economic prosperity, and was directed by local merchants and businessmen such as George McNeill, wholesale grocer, and James Kyle, dry goods merchant. Following general economic trends, the company prospered until the Civil War along with the rest of the community, but declined thereafter and dissolved in the face of a weak statewide economy by 1870, leaving the building free for a wide variety of commercial uses.

CRITERIA ASSESSMENT

- A. The Fayetteville Mutual Insurance Company, centrally located between Hay Street's wholesale grocery and dry goods districts, was formed during a period of economic prosperity, making property and fire insurance--available in preceeding decades only from out-of-town or out-of-state companies--available locally.
- B. Local merchants, businessmen, and professionals of note, such as George McNeill, and Thomas S. Lutterloh, wholesale grocers, and James Kyle, dry goods merchant, served as officers and/or directors of the local insurance company.
- C. The two-story trapezoidal shaped brick building c. 1853 is an example of the commercial vernacular Greek Revival with its even four-bay front and tin-covered hip roof, one of the only two extant antebellum commercial structures on the north side of Hay Street.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The Fayetteville Mutual Insurance Company, which insured property against loss due primarily to fire, was originated in 1853 against a backdrop of local antebellum prosperity. At least six local mills were in operation by the 1850s which made Fayetteville the central focus of North Carolina's cotton manufacturing industry.¹ Improved transportation came by way of radiating plank roads and steamboat travel. Merchants were encouraged and grocery and dry goods districts were established west of the Market House on Hay Street.² All of this contributed to an economic climate favorable for a local mutual fire insurance company.

The mutual principle, where policyholders became members of the insuring organization, elected officers and a board of directors at an annual meeting, and shared in the profits, was adopted by North Carolina insurance companies in the second decade of the nineteenth century. Fayetteville residents first subscribed to the North Carolina Mutual Insurance Company which between 1847 and 1853 saved them an estimated \$30,000 over the same insurance in foreign joint stock.³ By 1853, however, premiums paid to the company by local residents exceeded losses covered by about 5,000 to 6,000 dollars, and the same people felt that Fayetteville was "favorably situated" for her own insurance company. This led to the formation of the Fayetteville Mutual Insurance Company.⁴

Many of those who served as officers and directors of the fledgling company were local merchants, businessmen, and professionals, including George McNeill, H. L. Myrover, and Thomas S. Lutterloh, all of whom were wholesale grocers; A. A. McKethan, who operated a carriage maufactory; and James Kyle, a dry goods merchant.⁵ The memory of the fires of 1831, 1845 and 1846 were strong and the need for property and fire insurance essential.

Along with the new business came the need for a central office. On 17 June 1853, shortly after their advertisements began to appear in the <u>Fayetteville</u> <u>Observer</u>, Fayetteville Mutual purchased a parcel of land in front of the Methodist Episcopal Church where Hay and Old streets intersect.⁶ The owner of this property had been Archibald Graham, whose own shop stood just east. Subsequent transfers reveal that "the building and offices of said company" (constructed of brick) were situated thereupon; they were probably erected within a year of the 1853 property acquisition.⁷

9 MAJOR BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES

See continuation sheet.

10 GEOGRAPHICAL DATA ACREAGE OF NOMINATED PROPERTYLess than 1 acre.	•
UTM REFERENCES 1 7 /6 9 3 2 0 0 /3 8 8 0 8 6 0 A ZONE EASTING NORTHING C C	
VERBAL BOUNDARY DESCRIPTION	

All of Lot 1, Block E, Map 78-2-3-4, Cross Creek Township, as outlined in red on map. See map section.

(3-82)		Exp. 10-3	1-84
United States Department of the Interior National Park Service		For NPS use only	
National Register of Historic Inventory-Nomination Form		received date entered	
Historical Background	8 number	Page	2

OMB No. 1024-0018

NPS Form 10-900-a

Fayetteville Mutual Insurance Company flourished during the first half decade of its existence. In 1855, it insured \$882,228.00 worth of property and had \$128,584.26 worth of premium notes on hand.⁸ By 1859, the totals nearly doubled to \$1,563,490.01 and \$247,738.08, respectively. Assets in the same year--on the eve of the Civil War--amounted to \$254,618.62.⁹ No doubt the company's strategic downtown location between the Hay Street grocery and the dry goods districts contributed to its success. Evidence suggests, too, that the operations expanded regionally, since two directors from Wilmington and two traveling agents were added around 1859.¹¹ They lived up to the claim that they were "established upon a foundation which could not be moved."¹²

It seems, however, that the success was short-lived. By 1861, cash and other assets had dwindled to \$5,077.36.¹³ The company advertised through the close of the following year, but not thereafter. Several factors may account for this. First, trade and manufacturers, as well as related service companies like insurance agencies, had normal operations interrupted as Civil War activity intensified. Second, the local insurance company could not compete with economies of scale, like Aetna Insurance Company of Hartford, Connecticut. This agency's advertisement, which appeared alongside Fayetteville Mutual's in the 3 January 1861 <u>Fayetteville Observer</u>, listed assets of \$2,030,423.00 (\$850,303.15 cash) in bank, United States, state, city, and railroad stocks as well as mortgage bonds, real estate, and miscellaneous holdings. This had a tendency to minimize the importance of the local insurance company's \$5,077.35 worth of assets.

The offices of the Fayetteville Mutual Insurance Company were sold to James Kyle in 1869. The company seems to have been in dissolution and therefore sold the building far below its face value.¹⁴ It is doubtful that Kyle occupied the old headquarters, since he for many years operated out of a commodius location at the northwest corner of the Market House. Kyle family members owned the property until 1895, at which time it was transferred to W. B. McMillan.¹⁵ Subsequent owners include A. E. Dixon, Tildon Walker, C. W. Sandrock, C. W. Rankin, and Charles B. Taylor, all of whom had local commercial, construction, insurance, and/or real estate interests.¹⁶

The former Fayetteville Mutual Insurance Company Building has been leased throughout the majority of its late nineteenth and early twentieth century history for a variety of purposes. Until the second decade of the twentieth century, it housed shoe shop operations and gradually went to food items and offices.¹⁷ Since the 1920s it has served as a news stand, first C. B. Taylor's News Company and now "Point News."¹⁸ William Ward, who currently leases the building, has with his wife operated a combination newsstand/grill there for over thirty years.¹⁹

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Inventory—Nomination Form

Fay. Mutual Significance/ Continuation sheet Historical Background Item number For NPS use only received date entered

Page

Reference Notes:

¹Richard W. Griffin and Diffee W. Standard, "The Cotton Textile Industry in Antebellum North Carolina: Part II, An Era of Boom and Consolidation, 1830-1860", <u>The North Carolina Historical Review</u> 34 (April 1957): 144; Richard W. Griffin, "Reconstruction of the North Carolina Textile Industry, 1865-1885" <u>The North Carolina Historical Review</u> 41 (January 1964): 34.

8

²J. H. Myrover and the Bank of Fayetteville, <u>Short History of Cumberland</u> <u>County and the Cape Fear Section</u> (Fayetteville, NC: The North Carolina Baptist Publishing Company, 1905); hereinafter cited as Myrover, <u>History of Cumberland</u> <u>County</u>.

³Fayetteville Observer, 10 February 1853.

 4 Fayetteville Observer, 10 February 1853 and 4 January 1855.

⁵Myrover, <u>History of Cumberland County</u>, 12; Rev. L. Branson. A.M., editor, <u>North Carolina Business Directory</u> (Raleigh: Branson Jones, Publishers, 1867-8), 36.

⁶Cumberland County Deeds, Book 52, Page 173.

⁷Cumberland County Deeds, Book 59, Page 71.

⁸Fayetteville Observer, 4 January 1855.

⁹Fayetteville Observer, 5 January 1860.

¹⁰Myrover, History of Cumberland County, 12.

¹¹Fayetteville Observer, 5 January 1860.

¹²Fayetteville Observer, 4 January 1855.

¹³Fayetteville Observer, 3 January 1861.

¹⁴Cumberland County Deeds, Book 59, Page 71.

¹⁵Cumberland County Deeds, Book 99, Page 29.

16 Cumberland County Deeds, Book 138, Page 338; Book 162, Page 135; Book 275, Page 37; Book 276, Page 46; Book 330, Page 130; Book 379, Page 192, and so forth.

¹⁷1885, 1891, 1901, 1908, and 1914 Sanborn Maps for Fayetteville, North Carolina.

181924 and 1951 City Directories for Fayetteville, North Carolina.

¹⁹Interview with William and Helen Ward, by Linda Jasperse, 12 September 1981, Fayetteville, North Carolina.

2

For NPS use only

received

9

date entered

Page

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Inventory—Nomination Form

(Former) Fayetteville Mutual Insurance Company Building.

References

Branson, L. Rev., A. M. <u>North Carolina Business Directory</u>. Raleigh: Branson and Jones, Publishers, 1867-8.

Item number

City Directory for Fayetteville, North Carolina: 1924, 1951.

Cumberland County Records: Deeds.

Continuation sheet Bibliographical

Fayetteville Observer, 10 February 1853; 5 January 1860.

- Griffin, Richard W. "Reconstruction of the North Carolina Textile Industry, 1865-1885." <u>The North Carolina Historical Review</u> 41 (January 1964): 34 -53.
- Griffin, Richard W. and Standard, Diffie W. "The Cotton Textile Industry in Antebellum North Carolina: Part II, An Era of Boom and Consolidation, 1830-1860." <u>The North Carolina Historical Review</u> 34 (April 1957): 131 -164.
- Myrover, J. H. and the Bank of Fayetteville. Short History of Cumberland County and the Cape Fear Section. Fayetteville, NC: The North Carolina Baptist Publishing Company, 1905.

Sanborn Maps of Fayetteville, North Carolina: 1885, 1891, 1901, 1908, 1914.

Ward, William and Helen. Fayetteville, North Carolina. Interview by Linda Jasperse, 12 September 1981.

